

THE 'FREEDOM OF THEIR OWN RULE' AND THE ROLE OF THE PROVOST IN WOMEN'S MONASTERIES OF THE TWELFTH AND THIRTEENTH CENTURIES

Eva Schlotheuber*

The internal structure of female monastic communities and the role of women's spiritual advisors underwent a radical transformation in the course of the monastic reform of the high Middle Ages. In the early medieval period, bishops were practically the only spiritual authorities and representatives of the official church who were in a position to challenge the authority of noble women within *Frauenstifte*. In contrast, in the twelfth century, spiritual overseers of religious women began to emerge: provosts (*prepositi*) who were granted far-reaching authority, even extending into the inner affairs of women's monasteries. To be sure, women in early medieval religious institutions had also had clergy at their disposal for celebrating the mass, but they do not appear to have had a role in overseeing the women, or to have held any power to discipline them.¹ The office of provost was the consequence of a

* With thanks to Susan Boettcher for translating this chapter.

¹ Schreiner, 'Pastoral Care in Female Monasteries'; Röckelein, 'Bairische, sächsische und mainfränkische Klostergründungen'; Schlotheuber, 'Die gelehrten Bräute Christi'; Parisse, 'Die

Eva Schlotheuber (schlotheuber@phil.uni-duesseldorf.de) is Professor of Medieval History at the Heinrich-Heine-Universität, Düsseldorf. She is the author of *Klostereintritt und Bildung: Die Lebenswelt der Nonnen im späten Mittelalter mit einer Edition des 'Konventstagebuchs' einer Zisterzienserin von Heilig-Kreuz bei Braunschweig (1484–1507)* (Tübingen: Niemeyer, 2004) and has published widely on medieval education and library collections, the literary, material, and spiritual culture of late medieval women's monastic communities, and the representation of individuality in high and late medieval biographical and autobiographical literature.

Partners in Spirit: Women, Men, and Religious Life in Germany, 1100–1500, ed. by Fiona J. Griffiths and Julie Hotchin, MWTC 24 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2014), pp. 109–143

profound transformation of the religious life, arising from the monastic reform movement, which itself grew out of the investiture controversy. The grand confrontations of this controversy captured the sentiments of diverse social groups, both religious and lay. At cathedral schools and in cloisters everywhere, people debated the correct form of the religious life and the demands of reform.² In this atmosphere, religious, political, and social goals joined together, so that the stricter lifestyle in reformed monastic communities came to reflect not only a new spiritual self-understanding but also a new identity for monks and nuns.³

The difference between women's houses that followed the reform, whose members lived in strict enclosure, and the old, powerful communities, which often maintained close ties with kings or dukes, must have been impossible for contemporaries to ignore. The powerful abbesses of the Ottonian-Salian or Bavarian *Frauenstifte* frequently took politics into their own hands and were hardly less connected to dynastic and social matters than their worldly relatives.⁴ In the eyes of eleventh-century monastic reformers, this state of affairs obscured the original tasks of women religious. In response, the monastic reform movement, especially that aligned with the Benedictine abbey of Hirsau, developed a radical new ideal for the religious life, one that they sought to establish within male as well as female monasteries.⁵ According to this reform ideal, women were to dedicate themselves anew to the tasks of prayer and intercession. They were no longer to be occupied with increasing monastic properties or expanding their relatives' power; rather, they were to concentrate on the spiritual life by adopting a rule and through enclosure, which limited women's activity in the outside world.⁶

Frauenstifte und Frauenklöster in Sachsen; *Das Bistum Hildesheim*, ed. by Goetting, 1: *Das reichsunmittelbare Kanonissenstift Gandersheim* (1973).

² Goetz, 'Der Investiturstreit in der deutschen Geschichtsschreibung'; Suchan, 'Publizistik im Zeitalter Heinrichs IV'.

³ Patzold, 'Die monastischen Reformen in Süddeutschland'; Seibert, 'Kommunikation—Autorität—Recht—Lebensordnung'. On this topic in general, see Hartmann, 'Kirchenreform und Investiturstreit'; and Laudage, *Gregorianische Reform*; pp. 108–19.

⁴ Althoff, 'Ottonische Frauengemeinschaften'; Althoff, 'Gandersheim und Quedlinburg'; and Schlotheuber, 'Die gelehrten Bräute Christi', pp. 39–49. On later medieval *Frauenstifte*, see Sabine Klapp's contribution to this volume.

⁵ On the new ideal for female religious life in the twelfth century, see Griffiths, *The Garden of Delights*, pp. 24–48; Lutter, *Geschlecht und Wissen, Norm und Praxis, Lesen und Schreiben*; Hotchin, 'Female Religious Life', pp. 59–83; and Küsters, 'Formen und Modelle religiöser Frauengemeinschaften'.

⁶ Constable, *The Reformation of the Twelfth Century*, pp. 65–74.

This new ideal apparently corresponded so deeply to the needs of the age that almost all Saxon *Frauenstifte* had been reformed, or at least had a monastic rule introduced, by the middle of the twelfth century.⁷

How can we explain this fundamental transformation, which resulted in a completely different internal structuring of women's religious communities and which was not least the result of questions about the position religious women were to take in the developing hierarchy of the reformed church? The self-understanding of the women as influenced by strict enclosure, contempt for the world, and contemplation produced with it a new norm, one that has influenced our view of medieval monasteries until the present.⁸ But was the new self-understanding of the nuns, and the stricter form of religious life that emerged in the twelfth century, really as widespread as research often claims?⁹ Or is it possible that the reform movement only really gained acceptance in regions where the struggles of the investiture controversy meant that its religious goals were equally political ones? In the absence of a sufficient number of case studies, concrete questions about the establishment of enclosure and the role of male supervision in the female communities of the twelfth and thirteenth centuries in different regions cannot fully be answered. However, using two examples — the situation in Lippoldsberg and Lamspringe, reformed Saxon monasteries of the twelfth century, and in monasteries in the archdiocese of Rouen in the middle of the thirteenth century — I would like to illustrate how differently both religious life and the relationship of male spiritual superiors to religious women could be organized, even after the radical changes of high medieval monastic reform.

⁷ See for example Goetting, 'Hilwartshausen und Fredelsloh', p. 294. For the political backgrounds, see most recently Becher, 'Die Auseinandersetzung Heinrichs IV mit den Sachsen'; and Fenske, *Adelsopposition und kirchliche Reformbewegung*. Parisse, 'Die Frauenstifte und Frauenklöster in Sachsen', p. 474, notes that in the first half of the eleventh century *Frauenstifte* were repeatedly given over to bishops, although the Saxon nobility retained its right to name the *advocatus*. Reform in the second half of the eleventh century, which was prompted by different impulses in different regions, drew energy from two parallel currents, the Benedictine tradition and the reform of the regular canons; see pp. 485–87. Parisse emphasizes the differences in intervention in the Saxon and Westphalian female communities, although the latter frequently remained under the supervision of the bishop.

⁸ Schlotheuber, 'Die gelehrten Bräute Christi'.

⁹ On the introduction of enclosure in the course of the high medieval monastic reform and its consequences, see most recently Felskau, 'Von Brabant bis Böhmen und darüber hinaus', pp. 90–97.

*The High Medieval Monastic Reform Movement
and the Position of Religious Women in the Church*

According to the ethos of the reform movement around the turn of the twelfth century, nuns were to concentrate on religious duties. Responsibility for all worldly concerns was to be taken up by spiritual overseers, primarily provosts, whose services enabled religious women to observe enclosure in the first place. In keeping with the goals of reform, then, women's spiritual advisors gained greater prominence, while they also took on a new role in assuming a supervisory or disciplinary authority over the women.¹⁰ This new authority affected not only the organization of daily life within women's enclosures, but also their religious expression — that is, their duties in a theological sense. Provosts came to exercise a type of 'hinge function' (*Scharnierfunktion*) between the monastery, the church hierarchy, and the world, emerging as a mediating authority between bishops, as representatives of the official church, the families, and the women's houses. As a result, the introduction of strict enclosure and the redistribution of duties that resulted from it, were accompanied by a radical transformation in the inner structures of women's monasteries.

The subordination of nuns to spiritual overseers promoted by the reform movement needs to be understood against the background of fundamental changes in the position of women living in organized spiritual communities within the church hierarchy. During the twelfth century, the growing importance of canon law was accompanied by an emphasis on reason as a valid component of faith. At the same time, a more strictly defined church hierarchy emerged as a consequence of the struggle to distinguish between the rights of laymen and those of the clergy. Clerics educated in cathedral schools and universities were empowered to interpret the Bible, to give theological instruction in sermons, and to dispense the sacraments — tasks that were forbidden to women. Although this prohibition was as old as the church itself, these limitations now finally prevailed in the daily lives of nuns. The establishment of new norms against old customs was not simple, as powerful abbesses had previously taken on many of these tasks themselves. As late as 1210, Pope Innocent III forbade abbesses, once and for all, to consecrate nuns, hear confessions, read the Gospel to the sisters, and preach.¹¹

¹⁰ Hotchin, 'Female Religious Life', p. 71, and Griffiths, *The Garden of Delights*, p. 48.

¹¹ Schlotheuber, *Klostereintritt und Bildung*, pp. 104–11 (p. 107).

As churchmen laid down conditions for the valid performance of the sacraments and defined more clearly the responsibilities of priests, the position of religious women became noticeably weaker. In the eyes of canon law, consecrated nuns were lay women — a status that became decisive particularly since the period of the investiture controversy was one of existential struggle for the clear separation of the clergy from the laity. As a consequence, nuns were forbidden to undertake any service at the altar, which in turn was restricted to the clergy.¹² The significance of sacred space was emphasized, thereby pushing nuns out of the altar area entirely.¹³ In the subsequent period, the western galleries so typical of the late Middle Ages began to appear in nuns' churches. The spatial proximity of nuns' choir stools to the high altar may suddenly have appeared inappropriate; in any case, these architectural changes made it easier to realize the desired spatial separation of women from the clergy during the celebration of the mass.

As a justification for the diminution of women and their marginalization from the official church, theologians pointed to their allegedly lesser capacity to know God, which according to medieval conceptions was only possible through the *ratio*, the intellect which was held to be the most sublime aspect of the soul. Women were unable to know God via reason, it was held, because their intellectual capacities were naturally inferior to those of men. This notion had been inherited from the ancient world, but was reinforced by Christian thinkers. Thus the Church Father Augustine of Hippo had attributed to men the *ratio superior*, higher reason, and to women the *ratio inferior*, or lower reason.¹⁴ According to the influential theologian Thomas Aquinas (d. 1274), the physical weakness of women (*infirmitas*) meant that the soul developed less fully in the female body.¹⁵ The social subordination of women in medieval society under the *munt* (guardianship) of men seemed to confirm this notion as a natural one. Just as the senses required direction from the intellect, the *ratio*, so the female sex naturally needed steering from the male one. The possibilities

¹² See, for example, Thomas Aquinas, *Opera omnia*, ed. by Busa, I: *In quatuor libros sententiarum*, lib. IV, dis. 25, q. 1, 3 ('Utrum tamen episcopus ordinis sacramentum conferat'), p. 577: 'Virgines per benedictionem non constituuntur in aliquo gradu spiritualis potestatis, sicut ordinati constituuntur'.

¹³ For a different explanatory approach, see Muschiol, 'Liturgie und Klausur'. On the architectural form of convent churches and their use, see most recently Mohn, *Mittelalterliche Klosteranlagen der Zisterzienserinnen*.

¹⁴ See Schlotheuber, *Klostereintritt und Bildung*, p. 105, and Gössmann, 'Anthropologie und soziale Stellung der Frau'.

¹⁵ Aquinas, *Summa theologiae*, I, in Aquinas, *Opera omnia*, ed. by Busa, II, 7.93, pp. 322–23. For a critique of this idea, see Børresen, *Subordination et équivalence*.

for rational recognition of God were systematized by the scholastic theologians of the twelfth century and increasingly associated with intellectualism. At the same time, the more strongly conceived gender hierarchy required a more clearly defined path for access to clerical functions, and thus ultimately to the sacral sphere. Since this path was closed to religious women, as it was to lay people, members of these groups again found themselves, in a certain sense, outside the hierarchy of the official church.¹⁶ Reflecting contemporary thought in his *Summa theologiae*, Aquinas records that women cannot be deemed valid superiors of a religious community in the full sense, as they held spiritual leadership only 'by commission' (*quasi ex commissione*).¹⁷ Accordingly, nuns required mediators to access the sacred sphere and the teaching of the church — at least in principle. Clergy educated for this task were thus deployed as mediating authorities.

The 'structural' difference between the state of affairs before monastic reform and after it was clear to contemporaries. According to Idung von Prüfening, a scholastic at Regensburg cathedral and proponent of reform ideas around the middle of the twelfth century, women were not to have the 'freedom of their own rule' (*proprii regiminis libertas*), with the result that their spiritual lives required direction. Cut off from all worldly attachments, as Idung argued, nuns should perform their religious service under the supervision of provosts. He cites 'inborn changeability' (*naturalis mutabilitas*) and 'female weakness' (*muliebris infirmitas*) as justification for the subordination of women. Clearly, the subordination of women and their exclusion from the church of the clerics required explanation, given the fact that early medieval *Frauenstifte* had quite emphatically enjoyed the 'freedom of their own rule'. In typically medieval

¹⁶ Angenendt, *Geschichte der Religiosität*, p. 266. In response to this exclusion, mystics tended to express reservations concerning the permeation of theology by reason, such as those expressed by Marguerite Porete (d. 1310) in the introductory poem of her work, *Le Mirouer des simples ames* (*The Mirror of Simple Souls*): 'Humiliez dont voz sciences | Qui sont de Raison fondees, | Et mettez toutes vos fiances | En celles qui sont donnees | D'Amour, par Foy enluminees' (Humble your knowledge, | which is founded on reason, | and put all your trust | in those given | of love, illuminated by faith). Porete, *Le Mirouer des simples ames*, ed. by Guarnieri, p. 8, ll. 22–26.

¹⁷ Aquinas, *In quatuor libros sententiarum*, lib. iv, dis. 25, q. 2, art. 1, qc. 1–2, in Aquinas, *Opera omnia*, ed. by Busa, I, 578: 'Cum ergo in sexu femineo non possit significari aliqua eminentia gradus, quia mulier statum subjectionis habet. [...] De abbatissis tamen dicitur, quod non habent praelationem ordinariam, sed quasi ex commissione propter periculum cohabitationis virorum ad mulieres. Debora autem praefuit in temporalibus, non in sacerdotalibus, sicut et nunc mulieres possunt temporaliter dominari.'

fashion, Idung invokes the 'old and correct tradition' of the days of Benedict of Nursia (d. c. 547), from which he felt religious communities had later diverged. St Benedict, Idung claims, had purposefully not written a monastic rule for women; indeed, such a rule had not been necessary because in those days women had been subjected to the directive authority of the abbots alone. 'It is not salutary for this gender to exercise the freedom of its own rule', Idung writes, 'for one, because of its natural tendency to be fickle, and then because of the temptations that attack it from outside, which female weakness cannot resist'.¹⁸

In sum, the church hierarchy that developed during the twelfth century, founded on canon law, now also sought to control and discipline monks and nuns, as well as clerics. Religious women were now subjected more closely to ecclesiastical authority through spiritual overseers and the *cura monialium*, with the pope and the Roman Curia at its summit. Their integration into this structure of spiritual oversight was of increasing importance to the church, particularly since, from the turn of the twelfth century, the foundation of female religious communities was practically a mass phenomenon. The longing for and the possibility of choosing a religious life now appealed to a much broader section of society than ever before. From the perspective of the official church, the need for control was intensifying, underscored by the appearance of heretical groups like the Cathars and Waldensians, who questioned the authority of the sacraments, the church's power to discipline, and its authority to define doctrine.¹⁹

The establishment of enclosure, together with the new internal organization of female religious communities, had fundamental consequences for women's religious life: on the one hand, subordination of nuns to male spiritual overseers clearly limited women's autonomy in an institutional sense; on the other, the physical confinement within their living space — which can also be understood as protection — opened up a new spiritual landscape to women. Religious women and lay people struggled to establish their own forms of religious expression in reaction to the clerical hierarchy, whose boundaries had been more strongly defined by reform. This tendency was frequently connected

¹⁸ Idung von Prüfening, *Le Moine Idung et ses deux ouvrages*, ed. by Huygens, cap. 361, p. 75: 'Nullam vero regulam sacris virginibus scripsit nec scribere necesse fuit, quia virginum monasteria illis temporibus tantum sub abbatum regimine custodiebantur. Et consule! Non enim expedit illi sexui proprii regiminis uti libertate, tum propter eius naturalem mutabilitatem, tum propter temptationes extrinsecus advenientes, quibus muliebris infirmitas non sufficit resistere.'

¹⁹ On connections between the religious women's movement and heretical groups, see Grundmann, *Religiöse Bewegungen im Mittelalter*, pp. 230–45.

with a turn to the vernacular, which unmistakably separated them from the Latinate educated elite and which found its own expression in mysticism.²⁰

Female religious life would now develop on a foundation fundamentally different from that of men. While for men, the approach to God via rational insight was decisive, women were thought to achieve the greatest possible closeness to the sacred via their untainted physicality — that is to say, via virginity (*virginitas*) in emulation of Mary. The fifteenth-century *Ceremoniale* of the Benedictine monastery of Lüne makes this clear: *virginitas* renders nuns in the flesh 'more similar' or 'more intimate' (*familiarius*) with Christ, because their flesh, like Christ's, knows no corruption. Virginity thus qualified a nun to be the *sponsa Christi*, the bride of Christ, the highest king.²¹ Despite the increasing systematization of theology and a more strictly defined church hierarchy that excluded them from all of the offices and functions of the clergy, nuns developed a positive understanding of female religious life — albeit on a separate basis. A nun's capacity for proximity to God via unsullied physicality was exalted as marriage to Christ.²² As a bride of Christ, the nun supported the internalization of faith promoted by the theology of the twelfth century. The mysticism of Bernard of Clairvaux (d. 1153) in particular emphasized the spiritually intimate relationship of Mary to Christ, influencing perceptions of this relationship on a theological level. Mary, the first among the virgins, served as a model both for the nuns themselves and for the way that contemporaries viewed and understood the nun's role.

Betrothal to Christ allowed nuns an elevated spiritual position that compensated them — to some extent — for their subordination to the clergy. Perceived as brides of Christ, nuns were expected to serve as mediators between God and man. Indeed, contemporaries believed that the prayers and intercessions

²⁰ Dinzelbacher, 'Rollenverweigerung, religiöser Aufbruch und mystisches Erleben'; Grundmann, *Religiöse Bewegungen im Mittelalter*, pp. 452–75.

²¹ Lüne, Klosterarch., MS Hs. 14, *Ceremoniale*, fol. 29^v: 'Virgines tamen specialius Christo desponsari dicuntur, quia earum caro carni Christi familiarius se conformat pro eo, quod caro illa sicut Christi caro corrupcionem non sensit.'

²² Seeberg, *Die Illustrationen im Admonter Nonnenbrevier*, pp. 121–23. Seeberg argues that the iconography that developed at Admont in the context of reform in the twelfth century placed great value on the physical proximity between Christ and Mary: 'In Gesten und Motiven, wie dem Fassen der Hände, der Umarmung, dem gemeinsamen Thronen und der Krönung, werden Beziehung und Vereinigung von Braut und Bräutigam auf unterschiedliche Art dargestellt'; p. 121. Especially interesting in this context is the *dextrarum iunctio* depicted in the Admont nuns' breviary, which illustrated the legally significant symbolic action of the marriage of Christ with Mary.

of nuns were particularly effective, since virginity was understood as bloodless martyrdom, and nuns were thus equated with martyrs. It was no coincidence that a new genre, the *Speculum virginum*, emerged around 1140, at the centre of which stood the justification and explanation of virginity. These works elaborate the image of the ninety-fold fruit of nuns' prayers, making clear the high regard in which society held the pious works of religious women.²³ In typically medieval fashion, the prominent spiritual position of nuns as brides of the highest king often corresponded to their noble heritage. However, the nobility of nuns no longer entitled them to exercise unmediated political power, as they had often done during the earlier medieval period.

The new ideal of women's religious life appealed to every social strata, with the result that the number of women's monasteries doubled in the years between 1100 and 1250 alone. This period also saw a new emphasis on chastity, obedience, discipline, and loyalty to the monastic rule for women. Inseparably connected with the image of the nun as bride of Christ was an emphasis on her physical purity, which seemed at the same time to demand strict enclosure. This possibly was also connected with the symbolism of the nuns' habit. For Idung von Prüfening, the new inner attitude of nuns found its most convincing expression in their humble and simple appearance:

Holy virginity shows itself through indications that shine through from the innermost part of the person: They [the chaste nuns] are pale of countenance and ravaged by leanness, shamefaced of speech, obedient in listening, frugal in their victuals, abstemious in drinking, worthy of gait, poor of clothing. Their skin is smudged by their hair shirts, not cared for by bathing.²⁴

There was no room in this ideal for the splendid, self-assured appearance of Ottonian canonesses as representatives of their social estate. Instead, according to Idung, the humility and fragile virginity of the nun needed to be protected through strict enclosure. Determining whether nuns and monks should observe enclosure in the same way, Idung asked which vessel needed greater protection and supervision, a glass one or a golden one — both of which metaphorically

²³ *Speculum virginum*, ed. by Seyfarth.

²⁴ Idung von Prüfening, *Le Moine Idung et ses deux ouvrages*, ed. by Huygens, cap. 357, p. 71: 'Ornamenta vero quae Christus requirit in sponsa sua et per quae recognoscitur esse sua, sunt signa illa, quae gloriosae mentis sanctam virginitatem ostendunt, propter quae psalmista pulchre et signanter dixit non "intus", sed "abintus", quia sancta virginitas sic est in mente, ut exeat foras per sua indicia, quae sunt facies pallida macieque confecta, in loquendo verecundia, in audiendo obedientia, in cibo parcitas, in potu sobrietas, in incessu gravitas, in veste vilitas, cutis cilicio squalida, non balneis accurata.'

speaking represented the woman religious — and concluded that the protection and supervision of both, and correspondingly religious women, should be doubled.²⁵ In the dedication image of the Lippoldsberg Gospels, the nuns appear to correspond closely in posture and habit to this ideal of voluntary poverty and humility.²⁶ Their portrayal in this image quite probably had a programmatic function, as outer appearance is treated as a central element in the vows of the Lippoldsberg nuns (1095–1102), which required them to promise explicitly to wear clothing following the ‘custom of monks’ (*more monachorum*).²⁷

The Position of the Provost in the Reformed Benedictine Monasteries of Lippoldsberg and Lamspringe

Strict enclosure and withdrawal from the world decisively limited the nuns’ sphere of activity in the wake of reform.²⁸ But how did the relationship of the nuns to their provost play out in practice? The provost represented the nuns in the outside world, but in reformed communities he also functioned as the spiritual advisor who helped to form and supervise the new ideal of female religious life within the community.²⁹ For this reason, nuns were assigned reform-minded clerics as spiritual advisors; female communities were thus closely connected to reform circles through their provosts.

Lippoldsberg and Lamspringe were but two of a network of reform-oriented monasteries in twelfth-century Saxony and Thuringia. Other institutions in the group included the male Benedictine monasteries of Rheinhausen, Reinhardsbrunn, Helmarshausen, Bursfeld, and Corvey.³⁰ St Pancratius in Hamersleben, a house of reformed Augustinian canons and a centre of canoni-

²⁵ Idung von Prüfening, *Le Moine Idung et ses deux ouvrages*, ed. by Huygens, cap. 356, p. 70.

²⁶ Reproduced in *Helmarshausen*, ed. by Baumgärtner, p. 95, plate. 9.

²⁷ *Mainzer Urkundenbuch*, ed. by Stimming and Acht, 1: *Die Urkunden bis zum Tode Erzbischof Adalberts I (1137)* (1932), no. 405, p. 311.

²⁸ Lutter, ‘Klausur zwischen realen Begrenzungen und spirituellen Entwürfen’; and Muschiol, ‘Klosteralltag und Klausur’.

²⁹ Schlottheuber, ‘Die gelehrten Bräute Christi’, pp. 64–67. Griffiths argues that individual men in these roles did not necessarily hold negative views of religious women, but valued their spiritual worth and perceived themselves as fulfilling an obligation to minister to Christ’s brides; Griffiths, ‘The Cross and the *Cura monialium*’; and Griffiths, ‘Men’s Duty to Provide for Women’s Needs’.

³⁰ See Schlottheuber, ‘Die gelehrten Bräute Christi’, p. 61; Parisse, ‘Die Frauenstifte und Frauenklöster in Sachsen’, pp. 487–96.

cal reform in Saxony, also had ties to Lippoldsberg and Lamspringe, providing provosts for both communities.³¹ The canons’ openness to women is suggested by the fact that at Hamersleben, as in many other reform foundations, a female community had originally existed alongside the monastery. In Hamersleben, reform enthusiasm was matched by intellectual as well as political activity. The scholarly and highly regarded Hugo of St Victor (d. 1142) had been instructed in the canonical life at Hamersleben before he transferred, between 1115 and 1120, to the abbey of St Victor in Paris. Hugo, like Rupert of Deutz (d. 1129) and Honorius Augustodunensis (d. c. 1140), numbered among the most influential contemporary authors of the twelfth century — men who developed a new, rationally comprehensible biblical exegesis. Their works filled the libraries of women’s as well as men’s houses. Moreover, as centres of opposition to the imperial party in the struggle for Saxony, reform foundations like Hamersleben assumed a leading role in the bitter political and social confrontations of the investiture controversy.³² Their reforms sought not only to prevent involvement of the religious in secular affairs, but also to reverse the tendency towards increased interference by secular powers in the affairs of cloisters and cathedral chapters. These reformers resisted the Salian king Heinrich IV (c. 1050–1106) and his allies, whose rule they associated with such serious abuses as simony and clerical concubinage, as well as heedless interference in the administration of monasteries and churches.³³

Reform at Lippoldsberg and Lamspringe was directly connected to the political struggles of the period. When Archbishop Ruthard of Mainz (d. 1109) separated himself from Heinrich IV around 1100 and joined the side of the reformers, he immediately altered the form of religious life in the episcopal monastery, Lippoldsberg, reforming it according to the customs of Hirsau. Ruthard transferred leadership of the community from its former superior to Immida, a nun from the double monastery of Schaffhausen (diocese of Constance), a monastery that followed the Hirsau reforms.³⁴ Together with her

³¹ Peters, ‘Das Augustinerchorherrenstift Hamersleben’. For general discussion on the meaning of secular clergy, see Röcklein, ‘Die Auswirkung der Kanonikerreform des 12. Jahrhunderts’, pp. 60–63; Bomm, ‘Neue Lebensmodelle’.

³² Hoffman, *Bücher und Urkunden*; Fenske, *Adelsopposition und kirchliche Reformbewegung*, p. 164; and Goetting, ‘Hilwartshausen und Fredelsloh’.

³³ Seibert, ‘Libertas und Reichsabtei’.

³⁴ Elsanne Gilomen-Schenkel also discusses the place of Schaffhausen within the circle of Augustinian and Benedictine monasteries of men and women influenced by reform centres such as Hirsau in her contribution to this volume.

sisters, Immida introduced practices at Lippoldsberg that were strictly oriented to the monastic rule.³⁵ After its reform, Lippoldsberg enjoyed good connections to the south German reform centres; these provided manuscripts for the women's library.³⁶ Lippoldsberg may have served as a model for other women's houses: a similar religious-political climate influenced Lamspringe about thirty years later, when Bishop Berthold (1119–30) imposed stricter observance of the rule, or *ordo monasticus*, there.³⁷

Reform at Lippoldsberg and Lamspringe resulted in the introduction of a provost, whose arrival seems to have circumscribed the authority of both the monastery's female superiors and the nuns who held offices in them.³⁸ The constitutions of Lippoldsberg, composed around 1100,³⁹ mention the community's abbess, who until then stood at the head of the convent. After the reform, however, Lippoldsberg was led by a simple prioress.⁴⁰ Her position was reduced not only in title, but also in fact, by the institution of the *pater spiritualis*, or spiritual father. The provost, whose office ought not to be unoccupied (*qui numquam loco deesse debet*), now stood at the head of the internal monastic hierarchy.⁴¹ The importance of this newly created position can be seen in the requirement that the spiritual father be subject to the control of five neighbouring abbots. The new power of this spiritual overseer is suggested in the *Hortus deliciarum* of Herrad of Landsberg (or Hohenburg, d. after 1196), a product of monastic reform designed for the instruction of women. Here the provost is so highly esteemed that he sits, in the person of John the Evangelist, as the nuns' advisor next to Mary (first among virgins), while the office-holders of the monastery point out his power to make decisions with a demonstrative gesture.⁴² Here, then, we see the contemporary ten-

³⁵ Heinemeyer, 'Die Urkundenfälschungen des Klosters Lippoldsberg', and Küsters, 'Formen und Modelle religiöser Frauengemeinschaften', pp. 203–05.

³⁶ Schlottheuber, 'Die gelehrten Bräute Christi', p. 77.

³⁷ *Geschrieben und Gemalt*, ed. by Härtel, pp. 13–15.

³⁸ Hotchin, 'Female Religious Life', p. 71, and Griffiths, *The Garden of Delights*, p. 48.

³⁹ *Mainzer Urkundenbuch*, ed. by Stimming and Acht, I, no. 405, pp. 310–12.

⁴⁰ Parisse, 'Die Frauenstifte und Frauenklöster in Sachsen', p. 489; Röckelein, 'Die Auswirkung der Kanonikerreform des 12. Jahrhunderts', p. 60: 'Zunächst und vor allem führte die Reform zur Entmachtung der Äbtissinnen, die in den Kanonissenstiften mit umfassenden Rechten ausgestattet waren.'

⁴¹ *Mainzer Urkundenbuch*, ed. by Stimming and Acht, I, no. 405, p. 311. See also Hotchin, 'Female Religious Life'.

⁴² Griffiths, *The Garden of Delights*, plate 7. Griffiths offers an alternate interpretation of

dency towards increasingly strict hierarchies was replicated within monastic communities. In Lippoldsberg, the women honoured their provost, Gunther, around 1152 as their *paedagogos* — their teacher.⁴³ Gunther, who had come to Lippoldsberg from Hamersleben, played a prominent intellectual role in the community.⁴⁴ Provost Gerhard (c. 1178–after 1204) may have had a similarly influential effect on Lamspringe at the end of the twelfth century, having also come from Hamersleben.⁴⁵ The influence of Hamersleben is also apparent in the writings of the nuns of Lamspringe.⁴⁶

At Lippoldsberg, the nuns marked reform by reworking the community's history, in the form of a chronicle. Describing not only the theological but also the ecclesiastical and political bases of this new development, the Lippoldsberg chronicle nevertheless records the activities almost exclusively of men — the archbishops of Mainz and their own provosts, men on whom the nuns' spiritual life depended. Only in passing does the chronicle allow the reader to detect the presence of the nuns alongside their provost. Prioress Margaret acted in co-operation with Gunther; she had prompted the composition of the Latin chronicle, which traced the community's history from its foundation to 1152.⁴⁷ Unfortunately, the question of whether this chronicle was composed by the women themselves, as Walter Heinemeyer assumes, or by the monastery's clerics must remain open.⁴⁸ But even if explicit indications are lacking, it is nevertheless possible that the women were its authors: only in this way could they have composed their encomium to Gunther's activity as provost, which they

this image that similarly stresses the important function of the cleric for a female religious community. She suggests that Herrad used the figure of John the Evangelist to encourage the priest to fulfil his duties in emulation of John.

⁴³ *Chronicon Lippoldesbergense*, ed. by Arndt, p. 560. Provost Gunther participated in the reform of the canonesses of Hilwartshausen in 1142 as well; Goetting, 'Hilwartshausen und Fredelsloh', p. 294.

⁴⁴ Hotchin, 'Dilecto Fratri Gunthero', and Hotchin, 'Women's Reading and Monastic Reform', p. 141.

⁴⁵ Wolter-von dem Knesebeck, 'Lamspringe, ein unbekanntes Scriptorium'.

⁴⁶ Cohen-Mushlin, *Scriptoria in Medieval Saxony*, pp. 53–82; *Geschrieben und Gemalt*, ed. by Härtel, p. 20.

⁴⁷ *Chronicon Lippoldesbergense*, ed. by Arndt, p. 546: 'Pro amore, pro cautela nec non et honore loci subsequenter scripta, et cepta et huc usque perducta sunt, religiosa quadam virgine, tunc huius claustris priore, nomine Margareta satagente et precipiente, quod fieret.'

⁴⁸ Hotchin, 'Women's Reading and Monastic Reform', p. 149, argues for its composition by a cleric.

portray as rich in its blessings.⁴⁹ In contrast to the Lippoldsberg chronicle, in which the female community remains in the background, women appear as prominent actors in the Quedlinburg *Annales*. These annals were produced in the ancient noble *Frauenstift* at the beginning of the eleventh century, and were probably written by a canoness.⁵⁰ They depict women engaging in activity well beyond the boundaries of their own cloister, often against the backdrop of imperial politics.

Despite the observance of enclosure at Lippoldsberg, the women were quite capable of appraising political circumstances, personalities, and the activities of provosts, even if active intervention was no longer possible for them. The Lippoldsberg prioress Margaret obviously enjoyed high regard and great authority in reform circles. Sindold, the librarian at nearby Reinhardsbrunn, describes her as 'my spiritual mother' (*mater mea spiritualis*), who 'received [him]' before the altar 'in the place of a son' (*me suscepit pro filio*).⁵¹ The relationship between Margaret and Sindold hints at the informal networks that could develop between monastic men and women who were inspired by reform and devoted to promoting its aims. Although the prioress is not recorded as acting outside the monastery, she apparently remained a respected and sought-after interlocutor in reform circles. Sindold's high esteem is telling. A highly educated librarian, whose letters were collected as rhetorical examples, Sindold cultivated extensive relationships.

The office and functions of the provost as the spiritual overseer of women's communities gradually became established in subsequent centuries. The ecclesiastical hierarchy held tight to this structure, and in 1298 Pope Boniface VIII finally made the introduction of strict enclosure for all female branches of religious orders compulsory with the decretal *Periculoso*.⁵² New orders founded during the twelfth century and later customarily assumed the basic structure of spiritual oversight through clergy who, on the one hand, represented the women as a mediating authority in worldly affairs, and on the other, were responsible for the *cura monialium*. Through the *cura monialium* they could

⁴⁹ *Chronicon Lippoldesbergense*, ed. by Arndt, p. 555.

⁵⁰ The editor of this text, Martina Giese, assumes authorship by a Quedlinburg nun for good reasons; *Die Annales Quedlinburgenses*, ed. by Giese, p. 63.

⁵¹ *Die Reinhardsbrunner Briefsammlung*, ed. by Peeck, no. 34, p. 35. For Reinhardsbrunn, see Tebruck, *Die Reinhardsbrunner Geschichtsschreibung*, p. 83.

⁵² *Liber Sextus*, ed. by Friedberg and Richter; on this, see Makowski, *Canon Law and Cloistered Women*, pp. 133–35.

subject their subordinate female communities to the theology of the respective order, integrate them through the power of secular oversight into that order's structure, and supervise their lives in enclosure. In practice, the diversity of these tasks — and probably the growing size of monasteries as well — probably overtaxed provosts. In any case, the new orders typically split the functions of the supervisor, thus creating two offices: a secular administrator, responsible for economic affairs, and a cleric, usually a father confessor, for spiritual affairs.

Each order with a female branch wrestled to find appropriate solutions for the oversight of women's communities. In women's monasteries incorporated into the Cistercian Order, the father abbot (*pater immediatus*) supervised observance of the order's rules and decisions of General Chapter, and provided, or hired and checked, the male personnel responsible for the spiritual and economic supervision of the nuns: confessors, chaplains, procurators, and *magister curie*. During annual visitations, he informed the daughter house about the decisions of the General Chapter and subsequently reported the result of his visitation at the following General Chapter.⁵³ Thus the father abbot clearly acted as an intermediary between the order and the monastery, just as provosts of reformed Benedictine monasteries did as well. On the basis of his authority to correct and punish, the father abbot could exercise a great deal of influence over the women's spiritual lives. Following the directives of the order, the spiritual supervision of women was to be assumed by Cistercian monks, while lay brothers (*procuratores*) often supervised the monastic economy.⁵⁴ Through this separation of clerical (spiritual) and worldly tasks and functions, the Cistercian General Chapter sought to limit the powers that provosts (*praepositi*) in unincorporated monasteries could assume. These provosts were not monks but secular clerics. Their position was superior to the abbesses and as the highest-ranking cleric they not only stood at the head of the monastery, but also of the chaplains and the whole *familia*.⁵⁵ These powerful monastic supervisors could provide occasion for complaint, since their joint control of the secular and spiritual affairs of the women's house made it difficult to challenge their authority.⁵⁶

⁵³ See, for example, Goetz, *Pragmatische Schriftlichkeit*, pp. 278–94; Rückert, 'Frauenzisterzen und Paternitätsstrukturen in Südwestdeutschland'; and Mersch, *Das ehemalige Zisterzienserinnenkloster Vallis Dei in Brenkhausen*, pp. 76 and 135.

⁵⁴ Töpfer, 'Die Konversen der Zisterzienserinnen'. Revealing on this also is Mersch, *Das ehemalige Zisterzienserinnenkloster Vallis Dei in Brenkhausen*, pp. 82–93.

⁵⁵ Schlotheuber, 'Die Zisterzienserinnengemeinschaften im Spätmittelalter'.

⁵⁶ Mersch, *Das ehemalige Zisterzienserinnenkloster Vallis Dei in Brenkhausen*, pp. 75–87, surveys the tensions that could arise in the relationship between the provost and nuns of a monastery.

Like the Cistercians, the Franciscans and Dominicans transferred pastoral care of their female monasteries to members of the order who served as father confessors.⁵⁷ In keeping with the vow of poverty, the economic affairs of the mendicant orders were later taken up by secular administrators nominated by the founders of the institutions.⁵⁸

Notwithstanding organizational differences, a common feature emerges from this brief sketch of the arrangements made by various orders to ensure oversight of the monastic women in their care: close male supervision of the female religious life. Such supervision was a lasting consequence of monastic reform, whether by members of the respective order (such as Cistercian monks or mendicant friars) or by secular clerics appointed to serve as provosts. The integration of women's religious communities into the governance structures of the new religious orders during the twelfth and thirteenth centuries thus created real possibilities for intervention in the affairs of nuns through pastoral and administrative oversight. We turn now to closer examination of another region, where the sources offer unique insight into the relationships between women's monastic communities and the extent of intervention by ecclesiastic authorities.

Female Communities in the Archdiocese of Rouen in the Thirteenth Century

When Archbishop Eudes Rigaud (Odo Rigaldus)⁵⁹ visited the nuns of the Benedictine monastery Saint-Sauveur d'Évreux (founded in 1060) on 14 May 1250, he encountered a group of women who clearly enjoyed life. The women kept little dogs that they fed, as well as squirrels and birds, they possessed sumptuous accessories, and did not observe the monastic rule.⁶⁰ In response,

⁵⁷ Sigrid Hirbodian outlines the normative requirements for provision of the *cura monialium* to communities of Dominican and Franciscan nuns in her contribution to this volume.

⁵⁸ See, for example, Thoma, 'Ökonomie und Verwaltung in mittelalterlichen Frauenkonventen'.

⁵⁹ On Eudes Rigaud, see most recently Davis, *The Holy Bureaucrat*; Pobst, 'Visitation of Religious and Clergy by Archbishop Eudes Rigaud'; Schulman, 'Eudes Rigaud', p. 137; Cheney, 'Early Norman Monastic Visitations'; and Darlington, *The Travels of Odo Rigaud*.

⁶⁰ *Regestrum visitationum archiepiscopi Rothomagensis*, ed. by Bonnin, p. 73 (14 May 1250): 'Visitavimus monasterium monialium sancti salvatoris Ebroicensis, ordinis sancti Benedicti. Ibi sunt LXI moniales. Aliquando bibunt moniales extra refectorium et infirmitorium in cameris. Item, ibi sunt canes parvi, escurelli et aves. [...] Non profitentur regulam. [...] Carnes comedunt

the archbishop required the abbess to present her account books regularly to her officials and to inspect the cells of the nuns in order to ensure the absence of private property. Rigaud could hardly do more than that in the framework of a visitation, although he took his official and supervisory obligations over the monastic communities of his district very seriously. He supervised problematic monasteries quite intensively, visiting the Benedictine abbey of Saint-Ouen-de-Rouen fifteen times in twenty-one years.⁶¹ This atypical engagement was most likely due to the fact that Eudes Rigaud was the first member of a mendicant order to ascend the archiepiscopal throne of Rouen. As a Franciscan of the second generation, Rigaud may have seen his chance to agitate from a position of responsibility against ecclesiastical abuses that were the subject of frequent complaint. Rigaud had studied in Paris with the famous Franciscan scholastics Alexander of Hales and Jean de la Rochelle and had risen to the post of *magister regens* in 1245. When he was consecrated archbishop of Rouen in 1248, he already had a successful university career behind him.⁶² Above all, however, he had achieved a reputation as a moral-theological preacher, a fact that especially recommended him for the office of archbishop of Rouen. The French king, Louis IX, as well as the popes, valued not only his profound theological knowledge, but also his diplomatic skills.⁶³ Rigaud enjoyed such high regard among the Curia that Pope Gregory X chose him to preside over the second ecumenical Council of Lyon towards the end of his life.⁶⁴

As archbishop, Rigaud is known primarily for the journal of his travels, the *Regestrum visitationum*, in which he transcribed the results of his visitations over more than twenty years (1248–69).⁶⁵ His attempt to lead the male and

sine necessitate. [...] Item statuimus ut removeant corrigias ferratas et bursas inhonestas. Item statuimus quod abbatissa sepius visitet moniales et ab ipsis tollat bursas et auricularia que faciunt, nisi ea habebant de sua licentia.' On Saint-Sauveur d'Évreux, *Abbayes et prieurés de l'ancienne France*, ed. by Beaunier and Besse, VII: *Province ecclésiastique de Rouen*, ed. by Jean-Martial Besse (1914), p. 180. See also Johnson, *Equal in Monastic Profession*, p. 269, and on the observance of oaths, pp. 106–32. On the excessive clothing of the nuns, see Schlotheuber, 'Best Clothes and Everyday Attire of Late Medieval Nuns'.

⁶¹ On the frequency of visitations to particular houses, see the appendix in Johnson, *Equal in Monastic Profession*, pp. 269–72.

⁶² Davis, *The Holy Bureaucrat*, pp. 12–30, and Davis, 'The Formation of a Thirteenth-Century Ecclesiastical Reformer'.

⁶³ Schulman, 'Eudes Rigaud', p. 137.

⁶⁴ Schulman, 'Eudes Rigaud', p. 137.

⁶⁵ *Regestrum visitationum archiepiscopi Rothomagensis*, ed. by Bonnin. For general discussion of this genre, see Oberste, *Die Dokumente der klösterlichen Visitationen*.

female communities of his archdiocese back to a manner of life in accordance with the monastic rule was hardly a simple undertaking.⁶⁶ Success was mostly contingent on the superiors of the communities — that is, on their will and ability to enforce the desired changes, often against the wishes of community members.⁶⁷ In visitation reports regarding female communities, it is striking that the archbishop dealt directly with abbesses and prioresses. Neither a provost nor a father confessor appears to have acted as mediator. Were the women in Rouen still conducting themselves during the thirteenth century with the 'freedom of their own rule'? Male advisors seem to have played no role in making decisions about the internal lives of the women. They do not appear to have enforced enclosure, provided theological instruction, or obtained necessary reading for the women. Nor did men examine the practices according to which the nuns accepted new postulants, so that their numbers did not exceed the capacity of the monastery's property to support them. Even in questions to do with spiritual matters — confession or the regularity with which the nuns prayed the canonical hours — the archbishop turned only to monastic superiors.

The degree of women's autonomy is astounding when considered alongside the central role that spiritual supervisors had begun to play in the twelfth century. By the early thirteenth century, too, many changes had begun to emerge within reformed women's monasteries in the Holy Roman Empire such that the initial imposition of strict enclosure and the asceticism of monastic life may, in some places, have given way to greater laxity in observance. It is striking that no male authority emerges from the pages of Archbishop Eudes Rigaud's journal as a mediating authority between religious women and the outside world. The lack of such an authority made archiepiscopal intervention in the women's monasteries more difficult. The archbishop could not entrust the implementation of his reform measures in a female house to anyone other than the superior herself. As a result, his influence always remained episodic, even though he visited several houses, such as the Cistercian priory Saint-Saens,⁶⁸ the Cistercian

⁶⁶ On episcopal reform and its basis in the papal law decrees, see Davis, *The Holy Bureaucrat*, p. 67. For episcopal visitation in English nunneries, see Spear, *Leadership in Medieval English Nunneries*, pp. 41–59.

⁶⁷ Pobst, 'Visitation of Religious and Clergy by Archbishop Eudes Rigaud', p. 223. This study treats the five male communities of Jumièges, Saint-Ouen in Rouen, Beaulieux, Longueville, and Saint-Lô-de-Rouen.

⁶⁸ *Abbayes et prieurés de l'ancienne France*, ed. by Beaunier and Besse, VII, 67; Johnson, *Equal in Monastic Profession*, p. 71.

abbeys at Bival,⁶⁹ Saint-Aubin,⁷⁰ Villarceaux,⁷¹ and the Benedictine nuns in Saint-Amand (Rouen)⁷² or the priory of Bondeville⁷³ almost annually, and tirelessly admonished their residents not only to observe their orders' rule and accept enclosure, but also to abstain from private property.⁷⁴ Were the female monasteries of Normandy and England completely spared these changes to their inner organization and thus the requirement for supervision through spiritual overseers? Were they, as a result, able to receive their episcopal visitor directly as relatively autonomous and self-governed institutions?

As I have already argued, women's claustration was a characteristic feature of reform for monastic women.⁷⁵ But enclosure played a subordinate role in all of the houses in the archiepiscopal territory of Rouen.⁷⁶ Eudes Rigaud cannot be faulted for having been too severe in his ideas about enclosure. At Bondeville, he admonished the prioress that she should only let the nuns visit Rouen in good and honourable company!⁷⁷ Moreover, it was often the case that the archbishop did not actually find the abbess or prioress at the cloister when he arrived to conduct a visitation.⁷⁸ Even in the Cistercian monastery of Bival (founded 1128–54) relatives and friends went in and out, non-members ate in the community, and the nuns frequently left the cloister. Here as elsewhere,

⁶⁹ On Bival, see Malicorne, *Documents et courte notice sur l'abbaye de Bival*, and *Abbayes et prieurés de l'ancienne France*, ed. by Beaunier and Besse, VII, 66.

⁷⁰ On Saint-Aubin, see *Abbayes et prieurés de l'ancienne France*, ed. by Beaunier and Besse, VII, 75.

⁷¹ *Abbayes et prieurés de l'ancienne France*, ed. by Beaunier and Besse, VII, 80; Johnson, *Equal in Monastic Profession*, pp. 116–18.

⁷² Dierkens, 'Saint Amand', and *Abbayes et prieurés de l'ancienne France*, ed. by Beaunier and Besse, VII, 62.

⁷³ Bondeville was a daughter house of Bival; Johnson, *Equal in Monastic Profession*, p. 72.

⁷⁴ For Rigaud's visitations of women's monastic communities, see the excursus in Power, *Medieval English Nunneries*, pp. 632–69.

⁷⁵ Felskau, 'Von Brabant bis Böhmen und darüber hinaus', pp. 90–97.

⁷⁶ Johnson, *Equal in Monastic Profession*, pp. 150–63; Johnson concludes: 'Clearly, in actual practice religious women often did not live by the theory of enclosure, a reality that was true of nuns in southern France as well as of their northern sisters' (p. 157).

⁷⁷ *Regestrum visitationum archiepiscopi Rothomagensis*, ed. by Bonnin, p. 456 (20 March 1263): 'Inhibuimus etiam eidem ne permetteret aliquas ire Rothomagum nisi cum bona societate et honesta, et quod cito redirent.'

⁷⁸ *Regestrum visitationum archiepiscopi Rothomagensis*, ed. by Bonnin, p. 323 (Villarceaux, 23 November 1258).

Rigaud forbade secular people from entering the nuns' enclosure, though, significantly, he found occasion to make exceptions for the women's influential friends and relatives.⁷⁹ Close relationships between the women and the powerful families of the region, who frequently located their family mausoleums within female monasteries and liked to celebrate lengthy feasts there — particularly to mark their daughters' entrances into the cloister — were decisive for the economic wellbeing and integration of a monastery within a region.⁸⁰ A single institution could remove itself from this dynamic only with difficulty. As we have seen, high medieval monastic reform had consciously sought to remove nuns from contact with family through strict enclosure, the appointment of a provost as a mediating authority, and other measures, such as the prohibition of simony as a factor in the selection of candidates for entrance to the monastery or the assumption of godmotherhood. Yet, female monasteries in the archdiocese of Rouen still assumed, like noble *Frauentifte* of the early and high Middle Ages, social functions as sites of familial, spiritual, and economic prestige.⁸¹ Thus they displayed the consequences of close contact with the lay world: the conformity of nuns with noble customs of dress, neglect of the communal life, the cultivation of private property, and even the appearance of unwanted progeny. Her good contacts with the clergy gave Aeliz of Rouen, a nun in Saint-Aubin, the gift of a little boy.⁸² One imagines that the archbishop really might have dreaded his visits to Saint-Aubin. When he arrived there in

⁷⁹ *Regestrum visitationum archiepiscopi Rothomagensis*, ed. by Bonnin, pp. 116–17 (28 August 1251): 'Inhibuimus ne aliquis secularis introducatur claustrum, nisi forte tales de quibus esset scandalum arcere eos.' In 1255 he admonished the Benedictine nuns of Alméneches not to leave the cloister without the abbess's permission (p. 235). In Saint-Léger he reported that the women came and went as they liked: 'Moniales vadunt extra abbaciam quando possunt et reueniunt quando volunt' (p. 295, 31 December 1257).

⁸⁰ Schlottheuber, 'Familienpolitik und geistliche Aufgaben'. Johnson, *Equal in Monastic Profession*, p. 153, comes to the same conclusion: 'The most commonly authorized reason for a nun to be out of her monastic retreat was to secure powerful support for her monastery.'

⁸¹ Röcklein, 'Bairische, sächsische und mainfränkische Klostergründungen'.

⁸² In 1256 Eudes Rigaud confiscated the veils of Aeliz of Rouen and Eustachia de Estrepigniaco 'for a time' ('Velum autulimus ad tempus propter earum fornicationem'), because they were still associating with men and Eustachia had attempted to terminate her pregnancy (*Regestrum visitationum archiepiscopi Rothomagensis*, ed. by Bonnin, p. 255). She left the cloister and bore the child of the chaplain Johannes de Fry (p. 283). The offspring of nuns is reported regularly in the register, but the archbishop and the women's houses appear to have dealt with this problem rather pragmatically. See for example the visitation of Bival in 1256, when the nun Florence had already borne several children (p. 268).

1261, not only did he have to acknowledge the presence of another child born to Aeliz of Rouen, by this time her third, but also that of a further nun, Beatrix of Beauvais, who had delivered a baby in the interval as well.⁸³ In Saint-Saens, too, he encountered several instances of unexpected offspring.⁸⁴ Moreover, the prioress there struggled against challenges to her authority. She complained during the visitation of 1259 that the wealthy Jeanne Martel rode to visit her parents clad in a dark woolen cape with sleeves, and that she kept in close touch with her relatives via her own private messenger.⁸⁵

The male supervisors of these women were called provisors (*provisores*) or procurators (*procuratores*) in Rigaud's register and they typically staffed positions in property administration (*negotia*) for the nuns.⁸⁶ But they were no help to the female superiors facing disciplinary problems or in other cases that concerned the monastery's internal affairs. In contrast to provosts, these provisors were not clerics, but rather subordinate secular administrators. Women's communities could even get along without them, at least temporarily. In his inventory of abuses in Saint-Aubin in 1252, Eudes Rigaud noted the lack of a *provisor* only at the very end of the list of his admonishments.⁸⁷

Spiritual advisors also took on a very different role in these communities than in reformed monasteries.⁸⁸ One of the parish clergy celebrated the mass in

⁸³ *Regestrum visitationum archiepiscopi Rothomagensis*, ed. by Bonnin, p. 412 (1 October 1261). Further reproaches of this sort are frequent in the visitation of 1264 (p. 591).

⁸⁴ *Regestrum visitationum archiepiscopi Rothomagensis*, ed. by Bonnin, p. 338 (9 July 1259).

⁸⁵ *Regestrum visitationum archiepiscopi Rothomagensis*, ed. by Bonnin, p. 338 (9 July 1259): 'Johanna Martel erat rebellis et inobediens, et rixabatur cum priorissa et perregerat equitans cum cappa de burneta ad manicas ad parentes et habebat nuntium proprium, quem ad eosdem pluries destinabat.'

⁸⁶ Johnson, *Equal in Monastic Profession*, pp. 93–99. For discussion of the distinction between *prepositus*, *provisor*, and *procurator*, see Mersch, *Das ehemalige Zisterzienserinnenkloster Vallis Dei in Brenkhausen*, pp. 82 and 88–90. The title *praepositus* was used for the highest ranked cleric in the monasteries of Cistercian nuns, while *procurator* referred only to the director of its economy. The Cistercian authorities apparently viewed the title of *provisor* with ambivalence, and in 1267 the General Chapter decreed that provisors of monasteries of nuns incorporated into the order should no longer be called priors or procurators, but only procurators. *Statuta capitulorum generalium ordinis Cisterciensis*, ed. by Canivez, III: *Ab anno 1262 ad annum 1400* (1935), no. 10, p. 49 (1267).

⁸⁷ *Regestrum visitationum archiepiscopi Rothomagensis*, ed. by Bonnin, p. 146 (17 September 1252).

⁸⁸ Johnson, *Equal in Monastic Profession*, p. 181: 'Large, rich nunneries sometimes had an entire chapter of canons that served their needs and depended on them financially.' The Ottonian women's foundations also had such clergy, who were subordinated to the women.

Saint-Aubin.⁸⁹ In 1254, a cleric named Lucas dispensed the sacraments to the nuns. Though he was their confessor, he himself did not live chastely.⁹⁰ After his expulsion, the ladies had no confessor of their own at their disposal for years; in 1261, the register notes that they had lacked a confessor for a long time.⁹¹ There were no priests at all at Bondeville,⁹² and in the priory of Villarceaux, just as in Saint-Léger de Préaux,⁹³ there was no one who could ensure that the nuns went to confession once a month or that they celebrated the Eucharist.⁹⁴ The Cistercian Order, too, had its problems regulating nuns' lives in Normandy in accordance with its standards. In 1277 it was reported that the women of Villarceaux had come into conflict with the father abbot, and that there was a pressing need for reform there.⁹⁵

The relative inconsequence of male supervisors in Rouen probably resulted in greater autonomy for the women, not least in regard to economic affairs. Members of these monasteries were allowed to maintain separate apartments, and, where communal life had already disintegrated, individual nuns took care of their own needs. The archbishop may have admonished the abbesses regu-

⁸⁹ *Regestrum visitationum archiepiscopi Rothomagensis*, ed. by Bonnin, p. 319 (4 September 1258).

⁹⁰ *Regestrum visitationum archiepiscopi Rothomagensis*, ed. by Bonnin, p. 187 (18 September 1254). The nuns of Saint-Aubin might not have been able to have learned their monastic rule, as the French translation of it had been stolen from their chapter room.

⁹¹ *Regestrum visitationum archiepiscopi Rothomagensis*, ed. by Bonnin, p. 419 (3 January 1262). Before the next visitation in 1263 the archbishop had located a father confessor: 'Elemosinarius Sancti Victoris erat confessor earum de consciencia et voluntate nostra.' (p. 451, 22 January 1263).

⁹² *Regestrum visitationum archiepiscopi Rothomagensis*, ed. by Bonnin, p. 487 (March 1263).

⁹³ See *Le Cartulaire de l'abbaye bénédictine de Saint-Pierre-de-Préaux*, ed. by Rouet, for documents relating to this female monastery, as well as its 'brother' foundation, also founded around 1034 by Hunfrid, the lord of Pont-Audemere.

⁹⁴ *Regestrum visitationum archiepiscopi Rothomagensis*, ed. by Bonnin, p. 194 (Villarceaux, 25 November 1254).

⁹⁵ *Statuta capitulorum generalium ordinis Cisterciensis*, ed. by Canivez, III, cap. 15, p. 165 (1277): 'Cum gravis querimonia super discordia inter moniales de Villari in Normannia et patrem abbatem exorta ad aures Capituli generalis delata fuerit, ac ceterarum monialium de Ordine nostro reformatione, ordinatione et provisione indigeat, Cisterciensi et Claravallensi abbatibus committit ipsum Capitulum generale, ut super praemissis reformandi, ordinandi, disponendi et providendi auctoritatem et postestatem plenariam habeant.' See Ahlers, *Weibliches Zisterziensertum*, p. 92.

larly to review accounts with her officials, but beyond that, the women owed no one else an accounting of their finances except the archbishop himself at visitation.⁹⁶ A lack of social cohesiveness occasionally gave rise to unpleasantness in the everyday life of the nuns. For instance, at Bondeville the upper windows of the choir were broken, allowing doves to fly through them and disturb the celebration of the mass. No one in the community had attempted to address the problem until the archbishop arrived for his visitation. Observing that the many of the windows were superfluous anyway, Rigaud advised that they should be walled off.⁹⁷ Only in the ancient and powerful Benedictine monastery of Montivilliers, which refused to submit to visitation in 1259 on the basis of an exemption privilege, did a male cleric, a *magister Ricardus*, speak for the nuns.⁹⁸ After a great deal of controversy (*post multas altercationes*), in January 1260 Eudes Rigaud was finally able to convince the nuns of Montivilliers to agree in writing to his right of supervision — an interesting example of the establishment of an episcopal right of visitation over an older exemption.⁹⁹

The introduction of communal life was one of the central demands of monastic reform. Since the observance of enclosure and the women's communal dining were closely linked, it is hardly surprising that Rigaud complained of the dissolution of communal life and the breaking of enclosure in the same

⁹⁶ Johnson, *Equal in Monastic Profession*, p. 206: 'Although theoretically confined to the cloister, monastic women also took responsibility for that area traditionally assigned to men, the *Aussenwirtschaft*, or field economy [...]. But even when male provosts and bailiffs worked for a women's monastery, final responsibility and authority rested with the nuns.'

⁹⁷ *Regestrum visitationum archiepiscopi Rothomagensis*, ed. by Bonnin, p. 512 (12 April 1265): 'Conqueste fuerunt super hoc quod columbe volabant per chorum et cancellum et tumultuabantur ibidem impediendes divinum officium, ut dicebant; propter quod precepimus maiorem partem fenestrarum monasterii obstrui sive plastrari; plures etenim erant ibi superflue.'

⁹⁸ *Regestrum visitationum archiepiscopi Rothomagensis*, ed. by Bonnin, p. 353 (7 January 1259): '[...] vice quarum omnium magister Ricardus, clericus earumdem, respondit quod non, dicens quod numquam consentirent quod visitationis officium exercemus ibidem [...]'. For Montivilliers, see most recently Hall and Sweeney, 'An Unpublished Privilege'; and *Abbayes et prieurés de l'ancienne France*, ed. by Beaunier and Besse, VII, 63–65. On the visitation practices of the Cistercian superiors, see Oberste, *Die Dokumente der klösterlichen Visitationen*, pp. 32–36.

⁹⁹ *Regestrum visitationum archiepiscopi Rothomagensis*, ed. by Bonnin, p. 353 (7 January 1259). He inserted the nuns' agreement to visitation in his register, although the archiepiscopal *ius commune* opposed the privilege of exemption that freed the women from the jurisdictional power of the bishop. Nonetheless the nuns subjected themselves to his will, on the condition that all of the other liberties of the monastery be preserved. On this, see Hall and Sweeney, 'An Unpublished Privilege', p. 666.

breath. At Saint-Saens, eighteen nuns lived together with three lay sisters,¹⁰⁰ but each took care of herself, and the abbess neglected choir services. Daily chapter and the rule of silence were also of little meaning at Saint-Saens. According to Eudes Rigaud, the abbess did not dare to correct the sisters for fear of being accused herself.¹⁰¹ As noted above, provosts in reformed monasteries were responsible for the nuns' theological instruction and thus also for obtaining the necessary literature. This sort of care was apparently lacking in the female communities of Rouen archdiocese. In some monasteries, as at Villarceaux in 1257, even basic liturgical books were missing¹⁰² and it took four years to remedy this deficit.¹⁰³ The demand for training in Latin was also a frequent accompaniment to reform.¹⁰⁴ In Almenèche, however, the Latin of the nuns was no longer sufficient for them even to understand their own Latin rule, on account of which it was supposed to be explained to them regularly in French during chapter.¹⁰⁵

Houses that struggled with internal difficulties or whose customs transgressed canon law — such as the simony that often occurred at the entrance of new residents into the community — were visited by Eudes Rigaud almost every single year. In the tiny priory of Saint-Aubin, payments to the women's house at the reception of future nuns were customary.¹⁰⁶ Here, as in other cases, the archbishop sought to intervene with the direction that in future no one should be accepted into the community without his express permission — a

¹⁰⁰ *Regestrum visitationum archiepiscopi Rothomagensis*, ed. by Bonnin, p. 170 (26 September 1253).

¹⁰¹ *Regestrum visitationum archiepiscopi Rothomagensis*, ed. by Bonnin, p. 170 (26 September 1253): 'Priorissa non audet corrigere alias, quia offendit sicut et ipse. Ordo non servatur. Capitulum non tenetur.'

¹⁰² Thus in Villarceaux: 'Non habent libros sufficientes, deficiebant eis duo antiphonarii'; *Regestrum visitationum archiepiscopi Rothomagensis*, ed. by Bonnin, p. 281 (28 July 1257).

¹⁰³ *Regestrum visitationum archiepiscopi Rothomagensis*, ed. by Bonnin, p. 402 (14 June 1261): 'Pravos et insufficientes habebant libros.'

¹⁰⁴ The Latinity and education of reformed women's houses is exemplified by the reformed Benedictine nuns of Admont. See Beach, *Women as Scribes*, pp. 68–72. Admont was certainly an exception in many regards, but manuscripts copied by nuns at Lippoldsberg and Lamspringe suggest a high level of literacy there, too.

¹⁰⁵ *Regestrum visitationum archiepiscopi Rothomagensis*, ed. by Bonnin, p. 374 (9 September 1260); *Abbayes et prieurés de l'ancienne France*, ed. by Beaunier and Besse, VII, 222; and in general, Schlotheuber, 'Die gelehrten Bräute Christi'.

¹⁰⁶ *Regestrum visitationum archiepiscopi Rothomagensis*, ed. by Bonnin, p. 114 (7 August 1251).

prohibition that could be maintained only with some effort.¹⁰⁷ Again and again at visitations in Saint-Aubin, Rigaud found nuns whose acceptance he had not agreed to. In all periods of reform, visitors attempted to prohibit the acceptance of *domicellae*, girls who lived in the cloister only to be educated, with no intention to become nuns.¹⁰⁸ Since families pressured nuns to accept their younger daughters and monasteries profited financially from this practice,¹⁰⁹ nuns defended the practice by appealing to the poverty of their monastery. According to canon law, girls who lived at the monastery and were intended to become nuns could make a binding promise to enter religious life through the ritual of investiture before they reached their age of majority. The rite of consecration in this ceremony effectively promised them to the religious life, which they later confirmed through their profession once they reached their majority.¹¹⁰ These canon law requirements either were unknown to the Cistercian nuns of Bival or they consciously ignored them, since they even allowed minor children to take monastic vows, directly transgressing canon law.¹¹¹

¹⁰⁷ In 1258 the prohibition for Saint-Aubin was repeated (*Regestrum visitationum archiepiscopi Rothomagensis*, ed. by Bonnin, p. 319). At the 1258 visitation of Saint-Saens, we read: 'Item, due ibi erant puellule pro quibus rogati fuimus a priorissa et quibusdam monialibus ut eas recipi faceremus et velari. Quarum preces non exaudientes in hac parte, eas precepimus amoveri infra octo dies subsequentes; iniunximus autem eis ne aliquam recipere presumerent absque nostra licentia speciali'; *Regestrum visitationum archiepiscopi Rothomagensis*, ed. by Bonnin, p. 310. In 1259 the nuns had again admitted the daughter of a noble family without the bishop's knowledge and consecrated her as a nun (p. 361). In 1261 the archbishop refused to agree to the acceptance of five further nuns (p. 419), and in 1264 he again registered an admission against his will (p. 512).

¹⁰⁸ Schlotheuber, *Klostereintritt und Bildung*, pp. 127–34. This problem appears in numerous places, as in Saint-Sauveur d'Évreux (*Regestrum visitationum archiepiscopi Rothomagensis*, ed. by Bonnin, p. 220, 1 July 1250), where all children who had not yet been robed (*omnes infantes non velatas*) were to be expelled. At the visitation of Villarceaux in 1258 the children who had been taken in for education were ordered to be ejected immediately ('ut pueros quos in domo sua nutriunt contra nostram inhibitionem diu est eisdem factam, de eadem domo eicere non postponant'); *Regestrum visitationum archiepiscopi Rothomagensis*, ed. by Bonnin, p. 324. Eudes Rigaud ordered the same thing in the same year for Saint-Sauveur d'Évreux, *Regestrum visitationum archiepiscopi Rothomagensis*, ed. by Bonnin, p. 305. In 1260 he ordered Saint-Saens to expel the *puellas seculares* (p. 380).

¹⁰⁹ For Bondeville we read in November 1261: 'Plures puellule seculares mittebantur ibi cum sumptibus suis.' *Regestrum visitationum archiepiscopi Rothomagensis*, ed. by Bonnin, p. 410 (20 November 1261).

¹¹⁰ Schlotheuber, *Klostereintritt und Bildung*, pp. 134–46.

¹¹¹ *Regestrum visitationum archiepiscopi Rothomagensis*, ed. by Bonnin, p. 207 (27 February

High medieval monastic reform had insisted that nuns no longer perform clerical tasks. But Eudes Rigaud recorded, albeit only in Saint-Saens, that a nun assisted a priest at mass.¹¹² In Montivilliers, which had been able to avoid an archiepiscopal visitation for a long period due to its exemption, the archbishop was appalled that nuns lifted children out of baptismal basins — that is, they were entering into godmotherhood. The assumption of godparenthood had been forbidden to both nuns and monks, since it could promote excessive familiarity with the child's parents and with it the danger that religious godparents would give their godchildren preferences later in life.¹¹³

Conclusion

The integration of religious women into noble networks, their autonomy in economic affairs, and their independent position within the monastic community and in respect of the archbishop: all these things differentiated the female communities of Normandy from the religious institutions for women that had been subjected to monastic reform in Germany during the twelfth century.¹¹⁴ The new ideal of female religious life that had developed in the course of the investiture controversy resulted in a radical rearrangement of female communities. But although this ideal received general recognition among the Curia and thus became a normative expectation for religious women, its further development was by no means assured. The successful introduction of strict enclosure was dependent on the ability of monastic reform and its religious ideals to prevail in specific settings. The movement for monastic reform in Germany had evolved and developed its ideas in the struggles about the correct form of reli-

1254): 'Item iniunximus abbatisse quod moniales non facerent vota, quousque devenirent ad XIII annum.' In 1257 four *puelle* lived in Saint-Amand, who were however designated for a religious life (p. 285). The five girls referred to in Bondeville in 1257 were possibly only meant to remain in the community 'for a time': 'Quinque sunt domicelle, que non fuerunt recepte' (p. 189). Saint-Salvator (p. 305, 1 May 1258): 'Precepimus omnes puellulas non velatas penitus amoveri.'

¹¹² *Regestrum visitationum archiepiscopi Rothomagensis*, ed. by Bonnin, p. 187 (18 September 1254).

¹¹³ *Regestrum visitationum archiepiscopi Rothomagensis*, ed. by Bonnin, p. 517 (15 May 1265). For the prohibition against monks and nuns becoming godparents, see Angenendt, *Kaiserherrschaft und Königstaufe*, p. 146.

¹¹⁴ See Power, *Medieval English Nunneries*; and Spear, *Leadership in Medieval English Nunneries*, pp. 41–50.

gious life that took place during the investiture controversy. In different regions and within individual monasteries, these ideas had played a powerful role not only in the course of the bitter struggle for establishment of a form of religious life in accordance with the monastic rule, but in a political sense as well.¹¹⁵ It was only the connection of religious with political goals that led to the establishment of a new religious norm against old customs and the practices of the traditionally superior social strata.

The investiture controversy took a different course in England and Normandy than it had in German lands, and did not result in the sort of confrontation that had captured the attention of so many social groups in those regions influenced by the Salian emperors. In England and Normandy, bishops were subject to stronger control from kings and had a different position in the social and political constellation of their age. The lines of conflict ran down a narrower path and were limited mostly to the controversy between Henry I and Archbishop Anselm of Canterbury.¹¹⁶ Thus, reform thinking in the Angevin kingdom seems to have attracted interest from various social circles in a less radical way. Monastic reform movements adopted different contours in England too, where reform ideals were also realized through support of the new Gilbertine and Fontevraud Orders. These ideals did not, however, garner a similar level of support as their counterparts in Germany, making the broad transformation of religious life desired by reformers here more difficult to achieve. No visitation undertaken by an archbishop, no matter how sincere, could replicate the new religious ideals promoted by the reform movement and made manifest in the introduction of strict enclosure into female monastic communities. I would argue, in contrast to the usual account in the secondary literature, that this new form of religious life and, with it, the observance of enclosure, were established quite differently in different regions.¹¹⁷ The lively women of Saint-Aubin and the other monasteries visited by Eudes Rigaud clearly did not seek to adopt the spiritual ideal of interiority and withdrawal from the world. They appear, on the contrary, to have exercised the 'freedom of their own rule'.

Translated by Susan Boettcher

¹¹⁵ Goetting, 'Hilwartshausen und Fredelsloh', p. 294.

¹¹⁶ Most recently, see Vollrath, 'Der Investiturstreit begann im Jahr 1100'.

¹¹⁷ Most recently, see Bertelsmeier-Kierst, 'Bräute Christi', p. 15; and Felskau, 'Von Brabant bis Böhmen und darüber hinaus', p. 90.

Works Cited

Manuscripts and Archival Resources

Lüne, Klosterarchiv, MS Hs. 14 (*Ceremoniale*)

Primary Sources

- Die Annales Quedlinburgenses*, ed. by Martina Giese, in *Monumenta Germaniae Historica: Scriptores rerum Germanicarum in usum scholarum separatim editi*, 78 vols to date (Hannover: Hahn, 1871–), LXXII (2004)
- Aquinas, Thomas, *Sancti Thomae Aquinatis Opera omnia*, ed. by Robert Busa, *Indicis Thomistici Supplementum*, 7 vols (Stuttgart-Bad Cannstadt: Frommann-Holzboog, 1974–80)
- Le Cartulaire de l'abbaye bénédictine de Saint-Pierre-de-Préaux (1034–1227)*, ed. by Dominique Rouet, *Collection de documents inédits sur l'histoire de France*, série in-8°, 34 (Paris: CTHF, 2005)
- Chronicon Lippoldesbergense*, ed. by Wilhelm Arndt, in [*Supplementa tomorum I, V, VI, XII. Chronica aevi Suevici*], ed. by Georg Heinrich Pertz and others, *Monumenta Germaniae Historica: Scriptores*, 39 vols to date (Hannover: Hahn, 1826–), xx (1868), 546–57
- Idung von Prüfening, *Le Moine Idung et ses deux ouvrages: 'Argumentum super quatuor questionibus' et 'Dialogus duorum monachorum'*, ed. by Robert B. C. Huygens, *Studi Mediavali*, Biblioteca, 11 (Spoleto: Centro italiano di studi sull'alto Medioevo, 1980)
- Liber Sextus Sp. 1053*, in *Corpus iuris canonici*, ed. by Emil Friedberg and Aemilius Ludwig Richter, 2 vols (Leipzig: Tauchnitz, 1879–81), II: *Decretalium collectiones* (1881), pp. 1053–54
- Mainzer Urkundenbuch*, ed. by Manfred Stimming and Peter Acht, 2 vols in 3 parts (Darmstadt: Hessische Historische Kommission Darmstadt, 1932–71)
- Porete, Marguerite, *Le Mirouer des simples ames/Speculum simplicium animarum*, ed. by Romana Guarnieri and Paul Verdeyen, *Corpus christianorum, continuatio medievalis*, 69 (Turnhout: Brepols, 1986)
- Registrum visitationum archiepiscopi Rothomagensis*, ed. by P. Théodose Bonnin (Rouen: Brument, 1852)
- Die Reinhardtsbrunner Briefsammlung*, ed. by Friedel Peeck, in *Monumenta Germaniae Historica: Epistolae selectae*, 5 vols (Weimar: Böhlau Nachfolger, 1916–52)
- Speculum virginum*, ed. by Jutta Seyfarth, *Corpus christianorum, continuatio medievalis*, 5 (Turnhout: Brepols, 1990)
- Statuta capitulorum generalium ordinis Cisterciensis ab anno 1116 ad annum 1786*, ed. by Josephus Maria Canivez, *Bibliothèque de la Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique*, 9–14, 8 vols (Louvain: Bureaux de la Revue, 1933–41)

Secondary Studies

- Ahlers, Gerd, *Weibliches Zisterziensertum im Mittelalter und seine Klöster in Niedersachsen*, *Studien zur Geschichte, Kunst und Kultur der Zisterzienser*, 13 (Berlin: Lukas, 2002)
- Althoff, Gerd, 'Gandersheim und Quedlinburg: Ottonische Frauenklöster als Herrschafts- und Überlieferungszentren', *Frühmittelalterliche Studien*, 25 (1991), 123–44
- , 'Ottonische Frauengemeinschaften im Spannungsfeld von Kloster und Welt', in *Essen und die sächsischen Frauenstifte im Frühmittelalter*, ed. by Jan Gerchow and Thomas Schilp, *Essener Forschungen zum Frauenstift*, 2 (Essen: Klartext, 2003), pp. 29–44
- Angenendt, Arnold, *Geschichte der Religiosität im Mittelalter*, 2nd edn (Darmstadt: Primus, 2000)
- , *Kaiserherrschaft und Königstaufe: Kaiser, Könige und Päpste als geistliche Patrone in der abendländischen Missionsgeschichte*, *Arbeiten zur Frühmittelalterforschung*, 15 (Berlin: de Gruyter, 1984)
- Baumgärtner, Ingrid, ed., *Helmarshausen: Buchkultur und Goldschmiedekunst im Hochmittelalter*, *Die Region trifft sich—die Region erinnert sich* (Kassel: Euregioverlag, 2003)
- Beach, Alison I., *Women as Scribes: Book Production and Monastic Reform in Twelfth-Century Bavaria*, *Cambridge Studies in Palaeography and Codicology*, 10 (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004)
- Becher, Matthias, 'Die Auseinandersetzung Heinrichs IV mit den Sachsen: Freiheitskampf oder Adelsrevolte?', in *Vom Umbruch zur Erneuerung? Das 11. und beginnende 12. Jahrhundert-Positionen der Forschung*, ed. by Nicola Karthaus, Jörg Jarnut, and Matthias Wemhoff (München: Fink, 2006), pp. 357–78
- Bertelsmeier-Kierst, Christa, 'Bräute Christi: zur religiösen Frauenbewegung im 12. und 13. Jahrhundert', in *Elisabeth von Thüringen und die neue Frömmigkeit in Europa*, ed. by Christa Bertelsmeier-Kierst, *Kulturgeschichtliche Beiträge zum Mittelalter und der frühen Neuzeit*, 1 (Frankfurt a.M.: Lang, 2008), pp. 1–33
- Beaunier, Charles, and Jean-Martial Besse, eds, *Abbayes et prieurés de l'ancienne France: recueil historique des archevêchés, évêchés, abbayes et prieurés de France*, *Archives de la France monastique*, 13 vols (Paris: Abbaye Saint-Martin Ligugé, 1905–41; repr. Hildesheim: Olms, 1999)
- Bomm, Werner, 'Neue Lebensmodelle in einer funktionalen Gesellschaft: Die Prämonstratenser im 12. Jahrhundert', in *Macht und Ordnungsvorstellungen im hohen Mittelalter: Werkstattberichte*, ed. by Stefan Weinfurter and Frank Martin Siefahrt, *Münchener Kontaktstudium Geschichte*, 1 (Neuried: Ars Una, 1998), pp. 169–91
- Børresen, Kari Elisabeth, *Subordination et équivalence: nature et rôle de la femme d'après Augustin et Thomas d'Aquin* (Oslo: Universitetsforlaget; Paris: Maison Mame, 1968); publ. in English as *Subordination and Equivalence: The Nature and Role of Woman in Augustine and Thomas Aquinas*, trans. by Charles H. Talbot (Washington, DC: Catholic University Press of America, 1981)
- Cheney, Christopher Robert, 'Early Norman Monastic Visitations: A Neglected Record', *Journal of Ecclesiastical History*, 33 (1982), 412–23

- Cohen-Mushlin, Aliza, *Scriptoria in Medieval Saxony: St Pancras in Hamersleben* (Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 2004)
- Constable, Giles, *The Reformation of the Twelfth Century* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996)
- Darlington, Oscar G., *The Travels of Odo Rigaud, Archbishop of Rouen (1248–1275)* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania, 1940)
- Davis, Adam Jeffrey, 'The Formation of a Thirteenth-Century Ecclesiastical Reformer at the Franciscan Studium in Paris: The Case of Eudes Rigaud', in *Medieval Education*, ed. by Ronald B. Begley and Joseph W. Koterski, Fordham Series in Medieval Studies, 4 (New York: Fordham University Press, 2005), pp. 99–120
- , *The Holy Bureaucrat: Eudes Rigaud and Religious Reform in Thirteenth-Century Normandy* (Ithaca: Cornell, 2006)
- Dierkens, Alain, 'Saint Amand et la fondation de l'abbaye de Nivelles', *Revue du Nord*, 68 (1986), 325–34
- Dinzelbacher, Peter, 'Rollenverweigerung, religiöser Aufbruch und mystisches Erleben mittelalterlicher Frauen', in *Religiöse Frauenbewegung und mystische Frömmigkeit im Mittelalter*, ed. by Peter Dinzelbacher and Dieter R. Bauer, Beiheft des Archivs für Kulturgeschichte, 28 (Köln: Böhlau, 1988), pp. 1–58
- Felskau, Christian F., 'Von Brabant bis Böhmen und darüber hinaus: zu Einheit und Vielfalt der "religiösen Frauenbewegung" des 12. und 13. Jahrhunderts', in *Fromme Frauen—unbequeme Frauen? Weibliches Religiosentum im Mittelalter*, ed. by Edeltraud Klucting, Hildesheimer Forschungen, 3 (Hildesheim: Olms, 2006), pp. 67–103
- Fenske, Lutz, *Adelsopposition und kirchliche Reformbewegung im östlichen Sachsen: Entstehung und Wirkung des sächsischen Widerstandes gegen das salische Königtum während des Investiturstreits*, Veröffentlichungen des Max-Planck-Instituts für Geschichte, 47 (Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1977)
- Goetz, Hans-Werner, 'Der Investiturstreit in der deutschen Geschichtsschreibung von Lampert von Hersfeld bis Otto von Freising', in *Canossa 1077—Erschütterung der Welt: Geschichte, Kunst und Kultur am Aufgang der Romanik*, ed. by Christoph Stiegemann and Matthias Wemhoff, 2 vols (München: Hirmer, 2006), I, 47–60
- Goez, Elke, *Pragmatische Schriftlichkeit und Archivpflege der Zisterzienser: Ordenszentralismus und regionale Vielfalt, namentlich in Franken und Altbayern (1098–1525)* Vita regularis, 17 (Münster: Lit, 2003)
- Gössmann, Elisabeth, 'Anthropologie und soziale Stellung der Frau nach Summen und Sentenzenkommentaren des 13. Jahrhunderts', in *Soziale Ordnungen im Selbstverständnis des Mittelalters*, ed. by Albert Zimmermann, *Miscellanea Mediaevalia*, 12, 2 vols (Berlin: de Gruyter, 1979), I, 218–97
- Goetting, Hans, ed., *Das Bistum Hildesheim*, *Germania Sacra*, n.s., 7–8, 20, 26, 4 vols (Berlin: de Gruyter, 1973–2006)
- , 'Hilwartshausen und Fredelsloh: Zwei Stützpunkte staufischer Politik an der Oberweser im 12. Jahrhundert', *Archiv für Diplomatik*, 34 (1988), 279–324
- Griffiths, Fiona J., 'The Cross and the *Cura monialium*: Robert of Arbrissel, John the Evangelist and the Pastoral Care of Women in the Age of Reform', *Speculum*, 83 (2008), 303–30

- , *The Garden of Delights: Reform and Renaissance for Women in the Twelfth Century, The Middle Ages* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2007)
- , "'Men's Duty to Provide for Women's Needs": Abelard, Heloise, and their Negotiation of the *Cura monialium*', *Journal of Medieval History*, 30 (2004), 1–24
- Grundmann, Herbert, *Religiöse Bewegungen im Mittelalter: Untersuchungen über die geschichtlichen Zusammenhänge zwischen der Ketzerei, den Bettelorden und der religiösen Frauenbewegung im 12. und 13. Jahrhundert und über die geschichtlichen Grundlagen der deutschen Mystik*; (Berlin: Ebering, 1935; fasc. repr. Darmstadt: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, 1977); trans. *Religious Movements in the Middle Ages: The Historical Links Between Heresy, the Mendicant Orders, and the Women's Religious Movement in the Twelfth and Thirteenth Century, with the Historical Foundations of German Mysticism*, trans. by Steven Rowan (Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 1995)
- Hall, Edwin and James R. Sweeney, 'An Unpublished Privilege of Innocent III in Favor of Montivilliers: New Documentation for a Great Norman Nunnery', *Speculum*, 49 (1974), 662–79
- Härtel, Helmar, ed., *Geschrieben und Gemalt: Gelehrte Bücher aus Frauenhand; eine Klosterbibliothek sächsischer Benediktinerinnen des 12. Jahrhunderts*, Ausstellungskatalog der Herzog August Bibliothek, 86 (Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 2006)
- Hartmann, Wilfried, 'Kirchenreform und Investiturstreit', in *Ökumenische Kirchengeschichte*, ed. by Bernd Moeller and others, 3 vols (Darmstadt: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, 2006–08), I: *Von den Anfängen bis zum Mittelalter* (2006), pp. 231–42
- Heinemeyer, Walter, 'Die Urkundenfälschungen des Klosters Lippoldsberg', *Archiv für Diplomatik*, 7 (1961), 69–203
- Hoffmann, Hartmut, *Bücher und Urkunden aus Helmarshausen und Corvey*, *Monumenta Germaniae Historica: Studien und Texte*, 4 (Hannover: Hahn, 1992)
- Hotchin, Julie, 'Dilecto Fratri Gunthero: Provost Gunther of Lippoldsberg and the Reception of Hugh of St. Victor in Northern Germany', in *Texte in Kontexten: Gesammelte Studien zur Abtei Sankt-Viktor und den Viktorinern II*, ed. by M. Tischler, *Corpus Victorinum Instrumenta*, 3 (Münster: Lit, forthcoming)
- , 'Female Religious Life and the *Cura monialium* in Hirsau Monasticism, c. 1080–1150', in *Listen Daughter: The Speculum Virginum and the Formation of Religious Women in the Middle Ages*, ed. by Constant Mews (New York: Palgrave, 2001), pp. 59–83
- , 'Women's Reading and Monastic Reform in Twelfth-Century Germany: The Library of the Nuns of Lippoldsberg', in *Manuscripts and Monastic Culture: Reform and Renewal in Twelfth-Century Germany*, ed. by Alison I. Beach, *Medieval Church Studies*, 13 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2007), pp. 139–74
- Johnson, Penelope D., *Equal in Monastic Profession: Religious Women in Medieval France* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1991)
- Küsters, Urban, 'Formen und Modelle religiöser Frauengemeinschaften im Umkreis der Hirsauer Reform des 11. und 12. Jahrhunderts', in *Hirsau, St. Peter und St. Paul 1091–1991*, ed. by Klaus Schreiner, *Forschungen und Berichte der Archäologie des*

- Mittelalters in Baden-Württemberg, 10, 2 vols (Stuttgart: Kommissionsverlag, Theiss, 1991), II: *Geschichte, Lebens- und Verfassungsformen eines Reformklosters*, ed. by Klaus Schreiner and others, pp. 195–220
- Laudage, Johannes, *Gregorianische Reform und Investiturstreit*, Beiträge der Forschung, 282 (Darmstadt: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, 1993)
- Lutter, Christina, *Geschlecht und Wissen, Norm und Praxis, Lesen und Schreiben: Monastische Reformgemeinschaften im 12. Jahrhundert*, Veröffentlichung des Instituts für österreichische Geschichtsforschung, 43 (Wien: Oldenbourg, 2005)
- , 'Klausur zwischen realen Begrenzungen und spirituellen Entwürfen: Handlungsspielräume und Identifikationsmodelle der Admonter Nonnen im 12. Jahrhundert', in *Virtuelle Räume: Raumwahrnehmung und Raumvorstellung im Mittelalter; Akten des 10. Symposiums des Mediävistenverbandes, Krems, 24–26 März, 2003*, ed. by Elisabeth Vavra (Berlin: Akademie, 2005), pp. 235–24
- Makowski, Elizabeth M., *Canon Law and Cloistered Women: 'Periculoso' and its Commentators, 1298–1545*, Studies in Medieval and Early Modern Canon Law, 5 (Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 1997)
- Malicorne, J., *Documents et courte notice sur l'abbaye de Bival (arrondissement de Neufchâtel) du douzième siècle jusqu'en 1789* (Rouen: Cagniard, 1897)
- Mersch, Margit, *Das ehemalige Zisterzienserinnenkloster Vallis Dei in Brenkhausen im 13. und 14. Jahrhundert*, Denkmalpflege und Forschung in Westfalen, 45 (Mainz: Zabern, 2007)
- Mohn, Claudia, *Mittelalterliche Klosteranlagen der Zisterzienserinnen: Architektur der Frauenklöster im mitteldeutschen Raum*, Berliner Beiträge zur Bauforschung und Denkmalpflege, 4 (Petersberg: Imhof, 2006)
- Muschiol, Gisela, 'Klausurkonzepte—Mönche und Nonnen im 12. Jahrhundert' (doctoral dissertation, Universität Münster, 2000; publ. 2005)
- , 'Klosteralltag und Klausur: Die Regelauslegung Hildegards von Bingen', *Erbe und Auftrag*, 84 (2008), 263–72
- , 'Liturgie und Klausur: zu den liturgischen Voraussetzungen von Nonnenemporen', in *Studien zum Kanonissenstift*, ed. by Irene Crusius, Veröffentlichungen des Max-Planck-Instituts für Geschichte, 167, Studien zur Germania Sacra, 24 (Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 2001), pp. 129–48
- Oberste, Jörg, *Die Dokumente der klösterlichen Visitationen*, Typologie des sources du Moyen Âge occidental, 80 (Turnhout: Brepols, 1999)
- Parisse, Michel, 'Die Frauenstifte und Frauenklöster in Sachsen vom 10. bis zur Mitte des 12. Jahrhunderts', in *Die Salier und das Reich*, ed. by Stefan Weinfurter and others, 3 vols (Sigmaringen: Thorbecke, 1991), II: *Die Reichskirche in der Salierzeit*, ed. by Stefan Weinfurter and Frank Martin Siefahrt, pp. 465–501
- Patzold, Steffen, 'Die monastischen Reformen in Süddeutschland am Beispiel Hirsaus, Schaffhausens und St. Blasians', in *Canossa 1077—Erschütterung der Welt: Geschichte, Kunst und Kultur am Aufgang der Romanik*, ed. by Christoph Stiegemann and Matthias Wemhoff, 2 vols (München: Hirmer, 2006), I: *Essays*, pp. 199–208

- Peters, Günter, 'Das Augustinerchorherrenstift Hamersleben: Entstehung und soziales Umfeld einer doppelklösterlichen Regularkanonikergemeinschaft im hochmittelalterlichen Ostsachsen', *Jahrbuch für die Geschichte Mittel- und Ostdeutschlands: Zeitschrift für vergleichende und preußische Landesgeschichte*, 52 (2006), 1–55
- Pobst, Phyllis E., 'Visitation of Religious and Clergy by Archbishop Eudes Rigaud of Rouen', in *Religion, Text, and Society in Medieval Spain and Northern Europe: Essays in Honor of J. N. Hillgarth*, ed. by Thomas E. Burman, Mark D. Meyerson, and Leah Shopkow, Papers in Medieval Studies, 16 (Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, 2002), pp. 223–49
- Power, Eileen, *Medieval English Nunneries, c. 1275 to 1535* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1922; repr. New York: Biblo and Tannen, 1964)
- Röcklein, Hedwig, 'Die Auswirkung der Kanonikerreform des 12. Jahrhunderts auf Kanonissen, Augustinerchorfrauen und Benediktinerinnen', in *Institution und Charisma: Festschrift für Gert Melville*, ed. by Franz J. Felten, Annette Kehnel, and Stefan Weinfurter (Köln: Böhlau 2009), pp. 55–72
- , 'Bairische, sächsische und mainfränkische Klostergründungen im Vergleich (8. Jahrhundert bis 1100)', in *Nonnen, Kanonissen und Mystikerinnen: Religiöse Frauengemeinschaften in Süddeutschland; Beiträge zur interdisziplinären Tagung vom 21. bis 23. September 2005 in Frauenchiemsee*, ed. by Eva Schlotheuber, Helmut Flachenecker, and Ingrid Gardill, Veröffentlichungen des Max-Planck-Instituts für Geschichte, 235, Studien zur Germania Sacra, 31 (Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 2008), pp. 23–55
- Rückert, Maria-Magdalena, 'Frauenzisterzen und Paternitätsstrukturen in Südwestdeutschland unter besonderer Berücksichtigung des Zisterzienserinnenkonvents zu Lobenfeld', in *Kloster St. Maria zu Lobenfeld (um 1145–1560): Untersuchungen zu Geschichte, Kunstgeschichte und Archäologie*, ed. by Doris Ebert and Klaus Gereon Beuckers (Petersberg: Imhof, 2001), pp. 45–60
- Schlotheuber, Eva, 'Best Clothes and Everyday Attire of Late Medieval Nuns', in *Fashion and Clothing in Late Medieval Europe: Mode und Kleidung im Europa des späten Mittelalters*, ed. by Regula Schorta, Rainer C. Schwinges, and Klaus Oschema (Basel: Schwabe, 2010), pp. 139–54
- , 'Familienpolitik und geistliche Aufgaben', in *Die Familie in der Gesellschaft des Mittelalters*, ed. by Karl-Heinz Spieß, Vorträge und Forschungen, 71 (Sigmaringen: Thorbecke, 2009), pp. 223–49
- , 'Die gelehrten Bräute Christi', in *Die gelehrten Bräute Christi: Geistesleben und Bücher der Nonnen im Mittelalter*, ed. by Helwig Schmid-Glitzner, Wolfenbütteler Hefte, 22 (Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 2008), pp. 39–81
- , *Klostereintritt und Bildung: Die Lebenswelt der Nonnen im späten Mittelalter; mit einer Edition des 'Konventstagebuchs' einer Zisterzienserin von Heilig-Kreuz bei Braunschweig (1484–1507)*, Spätmittelalter und Reformation, Neue Reihe, 24 (Tübingen: Niemeyer, 2004)
- , 'Die Zisterzienserinnengemeinschaften im Spätmittelalter', in *Norm und Realität: Kontinuität und Wandel der Zisterzienser im Mittelalter*, ed. by Franz J. Felten and

- Werner Rösener, *Vita regularis: Ordnungen und Deutungen religiösen Lebens im Mittelalter*, 42 (Münster: Lit, 2009), pp. 265–84
- Schreiner, Klaus, 'Pastoral Care in Female Monasteries: Sacramental Services, Spiritual Edification, Ethical Discipline', in *Crown and Veil: Female Monasticism from the Fifth to the Fifteenth Centuries*, ed. by Jeffrey F. Hamburger and Susan Marti (New York: Columbia University Press, 2008), pp. 225–44; orig. publ. as 'Seelsorge in Frauenklöstern—sakramentale Dienste, geistliche Erbauung, ethische Disziplinierung', in *Krone und Schleier: Kunst aus mittelalterlichen Frauenklöstern, Ausstellungskatalog*, ed. by Jutta Frings and Jan Gerchow, in conjunction with Kunst- und Ausstellungshalle der Bundesrepublik Deutschland und Ruhrlandmuseum Essen (München: Hirmer, 2005), pp. 52–65
- Schulman, Jana K., 'Eudes Rigaud', in *The Rise of the Medieval World, 500–1300: A Biographical Dictionary*, ed. by Jana K. Schulman (Westport: Greenwood, 2002), pp. 137–38
- Seeberg, Stefanie, *Die Illustrationen im Admonter Nonnenbrevier von 1180: Marienkrönung und Nonnenfrömmigkeit. Die Rolle der Brevierillustration in der Entwicklung von Bildthemen im 12. Jahrhundert*, Imagines Medii Aevi: Interdisziplinäre Beiträge zur Mittelalterforschung, 8 (Wiesbaden: Reichert, 2002)
- Seibert, Hubertus, 'Kommunikation—Autorität—Recht—Lebensordnung: Das Papsttum und die monastisch-kanonikale Reformbewegung (1046–1124)', in *Vom Umbruch zur Erneuerung? Das 11. und beginnende 12. Jahrhundert – Positionen der Forschung*, ed. by Nicola Karthaus, Jörg Jarnut, and Matthias Wemhoff (München: Fink, 2006), pp. 11–29
- , 'Libertas und Reichsabtei: zur Klosterpolitik der salischen Herrscher', in *Die Salier und das Reich*, ed. by Stefan Weinfurter, 2 vols (Sigmaringen: Thorbecke, 1991), II: *Die Reichskirche in der Salierzeit*, ed. by Stefan Weinfurter and Frank Martin Siefahrt, pp. 503–69
- Spear, Valerie G., *Leadership in Medieval English Nunneries*, Studies in the History of Medieval Religion, 24 (Woodbridge: Boydell, 2005)
- Suchan, Monika, 'Publizistik im Zeitalter Heinrichs IV.—Anfänge päpstlicher und kaiserlicher Propaganda im Investiturstreit', in *Propaganda, Kommunikation und Öffentlichkeit (11.–16. Jahrhundert)*, ed. by Karel Hruza, Forschungen zur Geschichte des Mittelalters, 6 (Wien: Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, 2001), pp. 29–46
- Tebruck, Stefan, *Die Reinhardtsbrunner Geschichtsschreibung im Hochmittelalter: Klösterliche Traditionsbildung zwischen Fürstenhof, Kirche und Reich*, Jenaer Beiträge zur Geschichte, 4 (Frankfurt a.M.: Lang, 2001)
- Thoma, Gertrud, 'Ökonomie und Verwaltung in mittelalterlichen Frauenkonventen Süddeutschlands', in *Nonnen, Kanonissen und Mystikerinnen: Religiöse Frauengemeinschaften in Süddeutschland*, ed. by Eva Schlottheuber, Helmut Flachenecker, and Ingrid Gardill, Veröffentlichungen des Max-Planck-Instituts für Geschichte, 235, Studien zur Germania Sacra, 31 (Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 2008), pp. 297–313

- Töpfer, Michael, 'Die Konversen der Zisterzienserinnen von Himmelspforten bei Würzburg—von der Gründung des Klosters bis zum Ende des 14. Jahrhunderts', in *Beiträge zur Geschichte der Konversen im Mittelalter*, ed. by Kaspar Elm, Berliner Historische Studien, 2, Ordensstudien, 1 (Berlin: Duncker und Humblot, 1980), pp. 25–48
- Vollrath, Hanna, 'Der Investiturstreit begann im Jahr 1100: England und die Päpste in der späten Salierzeit', in *Salisches Kaisertum und neues Europa: Die Zeit Heinrichs IV. und Heinrichs V.*, ed. by Bernd Schneidmüller and Stefan Weinfurter (Darmstadt: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, 2007), pp. 217–44
- Wolter-von dem Knesebeck, Harald, 'Lamspringe, ein unbekanntes Scriptorium des Hamersleben-Halberstädter Reformkreises zur Zeit Heinrichs des Löwen', in *Heinrich der Löwe und seine Zeit: Herrschaft und Repräsentation der Welfen 1125–1235; Katalog der Ausstellung*, ed. by Jochen Luckhardt and Franz Niehoff, 3 vols (München: Hirmer, 1995), II: *Essays*, pp. 468–83